



Setti D. Warren
Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts
Department of Planning and Development
1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone
(617) 796-1120
Telefax
(617) 796-1142
TDD/TTY
(617) 796-1089
www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

**MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS
NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: March 26, 2015

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 205
7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: Nancy Grissom, Acting Chairman
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate
See Attendance List

Mark Armstrong, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Katy Hax Holmes, Staff

ABSENT: Len Sherman, Alternate
Laura Fitzmaurice, Member
Jean Fulkerson, Member

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with Nancy Grissom presiding as Acting Chairman. Voting permanent members were Armstrong, Dimond, and Templer. Klapper voted as alternate. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device.

1. **250 Waltham Street, Fessenden School – Demolition Review**
Request to demolish garage and add rear office addition to carriage house

Howard Levine, attorney, and a representative from Fessenden, presented their plan to demolish the garage located at the rear of the property. The application showed that the garage would be removed for extra parking. At the hearing Mr. Levine said the garage would be removed to allow room for a play structure. Mr. Levine told the Commission that this garage was located next to a former barn that NHC allowed to be removed administratively in the 1990s. He told the Commission that the garage was falling apart. Mr. Levine also offered to prepare a historic narrative and/or display to document the history of the garage for the benefit of students at the school.

The following research and write-up was prepared by Val Fram in our office. She is working toward a masters' degree in historic preservation.

The garage was built in 1909 under the term "automobile house" by R.L. Davidson, who did much of the construction at the Fessenden School. The application lists the dimensions of the wooden garage at 23'x24'

and 12' tall, with a pitched roof. It can only be assumed that it is one of the earliest examples in Newton of a building constructed specifically for the purpose to house automobiles. The architects were Gay and Proctor, a well-known architecture firm based out on Boston.

Gay and Proctor worked all over the country, but primarily in New England with buildings listed on the National Register, including the Locke School in Arlington, MA. It may seem unusual for a well-known architecture firm to design a garage, but it appears the firm was designing many buildings for the Fessenden School around that time. At the time of construction the garage was located towards the center of the campus, and included decorative features such as side columns and glass window panes above both doors. The garage can be seen on a 1917 map. The garage can also be seen on an aerial 1925 photograph of the campus towards the left center.

It should be noted that in the three years after 1925 a lot of construction had occurred in the middle of the campus, and the garage is not seen in a 1928 aerial photograph. It can be presumed it was moved to make way for even more new construction as the school was gaining popularity. Thus the garage was moved sometime between 1925-1928 to its current location, next to what used to be the school's barn and more towards the outside of the campus. It can be seen in its new location on a 1929 map. Naturally as cars got more popular, they also got much larger in size. To accommodate for the changing shape, the garage was altered by the widening of the two doors, and the removal of the window panes above the doors to allow for a vertical extension of the garage's openings.

Commission members noted that the architectural details formally seen on the garage were impressive, and that the garage with its loss of detail paled in comparison to what was there before. Discussion ensued as to whether these details could be restored. Staff explained to Mr. Levine that since all of the research they were offering to assemble was prepared by the City, the City would be happy to donate copies of its research on the garage, considered to be one of the first to be built in Newton, to the Fessenden School.

Klapper made a motion to find the garage not preferably preserved. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 2-3:

RESOLVED to find the garage at 250 Waltham Street **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Jeff Templer, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Nancy Grissom, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member

The motion did not pass. The garage is preferably preserved.

The Fessenden School then presented its plan to add an addition to an existing carriage house on the campus. The existing railing and deck would be removed to add a single-story wing containing three offices. The window motif found on the other three sides of the building would be repeated on the addition. The carriage house is an historic building and retains its mansard roof, as well as massing and scale.

Armstrong made a motion to find the carriage house preferably preserved. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the carriage house at 250 Waltham Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Commission members discussed the addition and thought the design and scale were consistent with the existing carriage house.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demolition delay on the carriage house addition based on approved plans presented at the hearing. Staff will review proposed materials and windows at a later date. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on the carriage house addition based on approved plans presented at the hearing. Staff will review proposed materials and windows at a later date.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

2. **12 Old Farm Road – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish all buildings on property

Lawrence Lee, attorney, and Judy Pearlstein, trustee for the owner's estate, presented a structural engineering report on the current condition of the house, and a letter from an insurance company denying the insurability of the house when vacant. Ms. Pearlstein told the Commission she took care of Dr. Sugarman for 15 years and could vouch for the deplorable condition of the house. Mr. Lee quoted from the engineering report that the house had, "major structural defects." Both Mr. Lee and Ms. Pearlstein reported that their neighbors did not want to see this hazard in their neighborhood.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1951 and designed by Ralph I. Williams. This Ranch style house was clearly designed by an architect for this location. The asymmetrical treatment of sheathing textures, metal windows, and apparently minimal alterations to this house are tenets of the Ranch style found in 1950s architecture. This house also stands alone as a ranch on a street of other architect-designed houses, one of which the Commission reviewed (25 Old Farm Road, different architect). Williams was prolific in Newton in the 1950s, and was responsible for the Esty Farm Road historic district, and houses on Evelyn and Mary Ellen Roads, Emmons Street, and others, which this Commission has also reviewed. Five of his houses/districts have been surveyed by architectural historians. Walter Berman, who was in real estate, was

the first owner in 1953 after Francis Callahan, the builder, and lived there through the 1960s. Herman Sugarman, a physician, lived here from at least 1975 through at least 1985. Staff recommends this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Commission members discussed the house and its neighborhood, with some remarking on the merits of its style and others stating their belief that the neighborhood was in transition and this house did not contribute any historical context.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-2:

RESOLVED to find the house not preferably preserved.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>	<u>Voting in the Negative:</u>	<u>Abstained:</u>
-----------------------------------	--------------------------------	-------------------

	Nancy Grissom, Member	
Jeff Templer, Member		
Mark Armstrong, Member		
	Peter Dimond, Member	
Ellen Klapper, Alternate		

The motion passed. The house is not preferably preserved.

3. **24 Duffield Road – CLG Eligibility report**
Request by Alderman to file report with MHC

Alderman Sangiolo submitted a formal request to research this property as potentially individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. This property was preferably preserved for architectural integrity and context at the NHC hearing on August 28, 2014. The staff report from that meeting appears below:

Built in 1911, this Bungalow Style house was first owned by John M. Groby, a manager in Boston. In 1913 Mr. Groby obtained a permit to add a piazza and pergola (still in existence), and in 1919 obtained a permit to build a garage. Groby still owned the home through at least 1940. By 1953, the home was owned by Edis VanLeir, who does not appear in directories by name. In 1955 the owner was Alfred Leiserson. By 1963, the owner was Robert Woods, and engineer. This house is an intact example of a Bungalow Style house in a neighborhood of other Bungalow Style homes built at the early 20th century near the Charles River. Though the house show signs of deferred maintenance it is an otherwise intact example of a style not often found in Newton.

Natalie Leif, owner of this property, attended with her two daughters to argue against a study report for finding the house individually significant. She told the Commission that she had been looking for a house for a long time and wanted to build on the Islington Peninsula. She said the neighborhood had a website so she thought connecting with the neighborhood on social media was the best way to introduce her building plans. She also told the Commission that she was not a developer intending to build condos on the site. She said she did not think the house met the criteria for historical significance.

The NHC hearing was attended by many owners in the neighborhood who represented both sides of the study report proposal. Kristen Simmons of 25 Duffield Road, who said she was an architectural historian, said

she told the owner that an addition off the back of this house would be preferable, but did not believe this house was individually significant, nor did she think it was the worth the taxpayers' money to have staff undertake this exercise. Michael St. Clair of 37 Duffield Road said he lived in this neighborhood for 39 years and deplored the idea of historic preservation ruining the cohesiveness of a neighborhood. He also said the houses at 17, 21, and 25 Duffield have been altered significantly and that the neighborhood had no aura of authenticity.

Lee Joseph of 21 Duffield Road, across the street, said that the issues that exist in the neighborhood should not be an NHC issue, and that it was not worth taxpayers' time to attempt to find this house historically significant. She felt it was arbitrary to impose this kind of study on the owner of the property. Larry and Kathy Waung, abutters to 24 Duffield, stated their belief that the environment was the bigger issue, and that they believed the house had historical significance. This house was built as a bungalow in the era 1907-1915, along with other bungalows in the neighborhood. They said the former owners of 24 Duffield did not make many changes to the house over time, which is why it is in original condition, though deteriorated. He said that whether or not this commission looks into the history of the house can be decided, but the old growth trees around the house are part of its context and historical setting and should be preserved.

Marlene Schwartz of 161 Islington Road said she had been in this house many times and could vouch for the fact that all the materials are original, though in disrepair. She said her house was a bungalow that she preserved after purchasing it, and believed it could be done here. Letters written in support of saving the trees and the house were read in to the record.

Alderman Sangiolo explained to the assembled why she filed the request to have the Commission approve a CLG study report for the potential significance of th house. She said she read through minutes and an old report by Lara Kritzer, saying this neighborhood had retained its early 20th century significance. The abutter at 37 Duffield refuted this, saying that 50% of the houses in this neighborhood were built around WWII. Only a handful were historic. He said in his 39 years this was the first time he had heard anything about a historic district for this neighborhood.

Commission members discussed whether or not to approve a study report. Comments were made to the effect that the selection of this house as a potentially significant seemed arbitrary in an effort to prevent the demolition of a single deteriorated house. Others commented, including staff, that there may be a potential historic district on the Islington Peninsula and that an objective study of the area should be undertaken.

Templer made a motion to not approve a CLG study report for 24 Duffield Road. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to not approve a CLG study report for 24 Duffield Road.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

4. **29 Parker Avenue – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish all buildings on property

Dan Demeo presented his plan to demolish the house at this address. He told the Commission he believed there was no historical significance to this ranch style house and that the houses on either side were new.

Staff reported that his house was built in 1951 as a ranch with a one car garage. The original owner of the house, Jason Backalee, and his family have owned this house since it was built. The house was recently purchased by Dan Demeo with a contract to purchase. According to the Law Dept, because a purchase and sale agreement would be signed two days before the March hearing, staff was encouraged to add this address on the agenda. This neighborhood is under transition and staff did not think this house a particularly notable example of this style of architecture. Therefore staff recommended this house not preferably preserved.

An abutter at 21 Parker Avenue told the Commission that the house's occupant died in December, and that this was the first he had heard about a demolition of the house. Mr. Demeo told the Commission he was hoping to raise the roof and build a center-entrance Colonial that would fit with the scale of the neighborhood. Commission members agreed that the current house did not appear to meet criteria for historical significance.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 29 Parker Avenue not preferably preserved. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 29 Parker Avenue **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

5. **44 Lombard Street – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish all buildings on property

The owner of this house withdrew plans to be heard at this hearing. There was no owner in attendance.

6. **286 Webster Street – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish all structures and shed

No owner attended to present this item.

Staff reported that this Colonial Revival style house first appeared on historic atlases in 1907 under the ownership of Ezra Forte, a carpenter. By 1917, the house had three outbuildings associated with it: one on this lot, and two on another Forte-owned lot just west of this lot. This was also true in 1929. In 1914, a permit was pulled to demolish a portion of the hen house and extend it over a concrete foundation. In 1922 Ezra Forte added a roof over the piazza. In 1925 he pulled a permit to build a detached one car garage. Ezra

Forte owned the house until at least 1936. By 1948 the owner was Walter Plamondon, a sewing machine repairman. In the 1950s the owner was Joseph H. Scott. In 1970 another sewing machine operator, William Lloyd, resided in the house, and continued to own it through at least 1996. Though windows have been replaced and the sheathing has changed, the house retains its overall massing, scale, and style, as does the surrounding neighborhood. Staff recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Commission members discussed the fact that this house was similar to others in the neighborhood, even though they had been preserved to varying degrees over time. Peter Harrington, who spoke on behalf of his employee who lived next door to this house, spoke to its historic context in the neighborhood and said he hoped it would be found preferably preserved.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 286 Webster Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 286 Webster Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

7. **40 Beaumont Avenue – Demolition review**

Request to demolish house

Armando Petruzzello told the Commission he paid too much money for this house to preserve it. He said it was difficult to find a property to develop in Newton and that this was a beautiful piece of land.

Staff reported that this Colonial Revival style house was built in 1935 with a two-car garage built the same year. First owned by Richard N. Eng, the architect was F.C. Pearce. The house was listed as vacant in 1936, but by the 1940s the house was owned by Curtis Mosher who worked in insurance. His widow Jeanette owned the house in 1955. In 1963 Boris Seinoir, a doctor at Boston City Hospital, owned the house. By 1967 this lot was combined with the one next door, and the two-car garage was remodeled into a family room. A tool and bike shed was also built the same year. Built as a nod to the Federal Style architecture found in New England up until the 1830s, this five-bay hipped roof house on a large lot is a well-appointed example of Colonial Revival architecture not often found in the post-Depression era in Newton. Staff recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

An abutter living at 21 Prospect Park said the neighborhood was an old one and that she loved the house. She also said it was a beautiful lot full of old trees and that she did not want to see them come down. An abutter at 33 Beaumont said it was really scary to see a million-plus dollar houses come down.

Commission members discussed the elements of the house worth preserving.

Klapper made a motion to find the house at 40 Beaumont Avenue preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 40 Beaumont Avenue preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

8. **28-30 Coyne Road – Demolition Review**

Request to demolish two-family house and detached garage

The owner of this house, Ramin Doorandish, said he owned the house for about 20 years and thought it was time to tear it down. He told the Commission that Coyne Road was not a street that lent itself to a single family dwelling anymore, because condos were being built all up and down the street. He said he wanted to change the zoning of his lot if he could.

Staff reported that this house was built c.1910 for Patrick C. Cotter, a son of Irish immigrants and of the family for whom Cotter Road was named. This parcel was part of two much larger lots owned by the heirs of Mary Cotter located on the south side of Fuller Street. By 1907, Coyne Road was platted on the Cotter property and led south to five outbuildings owned and operated by the Jeremiah Cotter & Sons Masonry Company. The Cotter family resided at 64 Fuller Street, which is still standing at the southeast corner of Coyne and Fuller. Another son resided at 40 Fuller Street. Patrick Cotter was one of three sons who operated this business. No house was standing at this location in 1907, but was here by 1917 and Patrick Cotter is the first owner of record. Cotter still owned this single-family house through at least 1935. By 1947, the owner was John Fisher, and under his ownership the front and rear porches were repaired. Harriet and Gordon Gifford owned the house by 1953, and in 1960 reported in a building permit that the house was now two-family and that it had been built in 1900. From at least 1965 through 1980, the house was owned by Charles Train, Jr. This one and a half story house is a three-bay by two-bay house with an enclosed front porch and symmetrical chimneys, and is the oldest house on the street. This house retains its original massing, scale, and location. For this reason staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Bill Roesner, an abutter on Coyne Road, said there have been six or seven demos on his street in the last five years. He said this Colonial Revival house was an okay example but not a great one. Commission members said they thought the house was quirky, but not compelling enough to save. Others agreed that the neighborhood was in transition.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house at 28-30 Coyne Road not preferably preserved. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-2:

RESOLVED to find the house at 28-30 Coyne Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Nancy Grissom, Member
Peter Dimond, Member

9. **40 Heatherland Road – Demolition Review**
Request to demolish house and shed

John Hayden attended the meeting to represent his mother-in-law, the current owner of the house. Mr. Hayden said the current owner was 92 years old and in good health, which prompted the family to consider replacing this house with a bigger one where they could all live together.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1951, this small Ranch house was built by Roman Ramirez of Beaconwood Trust and designed by J. H. Woods. In 1954, a single car garage and breezeway were attached to the east side of the house. In 1955, a rear addition was added to the kitchen. This house is an altered version of this style in a neighborhood of other small ranch houses. Roman Ramirez, a hairdresser, continued to own the house until at least 1985. Historic context appears to be intact in this neighborhood, though this particular house does not appear to be a well-preserved example of this style. Staff had a hard time recommending this house preferably preserved.

Commission members discussed the neighborhood context and the role of this building in it. Mr. Hayden told the Commission that this house was a handyman special but it meant a lot to the current owner.

Klapper made a motion to find the house at 40 Heatherwood Road not preferably preserved. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 40 Heatherwood Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

10. **73 Charlemont Street – Demolition Review**
Request to add a second story

Alexander Androsenko and his wife recently bought this house from the longtime owners, the Cox family, and wanted to add a second story. They said the roof was in poor shape and there was green stuff on the rear of the house.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1928, and that this small cross-gable cottage is one of a few remaining houses of this style in the original neighborhood. Windows have been replaced and the house is aluminum sided, but the massing, scale and style are intact and are similar in form to the two houses to the east. In 1928 the owner was Leslie Quinton, and the house was designed by Howard Cuttler. Maurice Sheehan was residing there in 1936. Emilie Macphee lived here in 1945. By 1955, longtime owner James Cox, a police officer, owned the house. In 1958 he added two rooms to the rear. In 1966 he removed half of the front porch and repaired and replaced timber where necessary. Cox still owned the house through the 1970s. A major development occurred across the street (an anomaly) and some others further down the street, but staff had a hard time letting this house go administratively when there was existing historic fabric in close proximity to this house. Staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members discussed the large homes built on this block, as well as the small enclave of original cottages located at the center of the street, of which this was one.

Dimond made a motion to find the house at 73 Charlemont Street preferably preserved for historic context. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 73 Charlemont Street preferably preserved for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper

Commission members discussed the proposed plan for the second story and expressed its opinion that it respected the smaller scale of the remaining cottages.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay on this address, with the condition that staff approves the final set of plans. Templer seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to waive the demo delay on this address, with the condition that staff approves the final set of plans.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

11. **47 Chandler Place – Demolition Review**
Request to demolish house

Ward Shifman, who represented the owner Paula Spink, the owner, was in attendance. Mr. Shifman told the Commission he planned to demolish this house and add more units to be part of the development he just completed on Elliot Street, but not contiguously.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1960, and that this Cape Style house is located in a neighborhood of capes and ranches from a similar period. The first owner was Robert L. Kandar, a plumber. The Kandar family continued to live here until at least 1980. The context of this house has been compromised over time by recent development. There is in fact visual evidence that this too was an infill house, as it is located behind the site of once was the Wetherell House. A building lot for this property was created by a variance to add square footage from the Wetherell lot to this one. The house is not an old or well preserved example of the Cape Style and lacks historic context. As such staff recommended this house not preferably preserved.

Paula Kelleher, an abutter at 17 Elliot Terrace, reported that there were 16 structures on Chandler Place, 14 of which were built between 1855 and 1900. The original houses all stayed, she said. One was built in 1961 and another townhouse in 1997. She told the Commission that this house was built by the original owner for his family and that did not do it for profit. Paula Spink is reportedly the granddaughter of the house's original owner. The abutter at Chandler Place testified to this and said he lived in the neighborhood for 36 years. The concern expressed by both abutters was that the neighborhood would see more construction, blocked traffic and more noise. Mr. Shifman said he did not believe this house added to the architectural context of the neighborhood and had no individual significance.

Commission members discussed the house and its merits in relation to other houses in the neighborhood.

Dimond made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. There was no second.

Templer made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 47 Chandler Place not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member

Jeff Templer, Member

Mark Armstrong, Member

Peter Dimond, Member

Ellen Klapper

1. **16 Keefe Avenue – Partial Demolition Review**

Request to remove portion rear façade

Ward Shifman presented his plan to add to the rear of this house.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1917 for, and owned by the same family until at least 1985, a total of almost 80 years. The first owner was Rocco Schiavone, a machinist. The house was designed by John E. Titus of Upper Falls and was built by Francis Miller from the Highlands. A one-car garage was built in 1923. A house plan from 1923 shows a front porch and steps and a small rear ell. Anne Schiavone was the subsequent owner in the 1970s and 80s. This Colonial Revival house with hipped roof, dormer and open veranda with squared posts is typical of this style, as are the staggered stair windows at the north side of the

house. The house is also located in a neighborhood of houses from a similar era. Staff therefore recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Commission members commented that the house was a handsome Colonial Revival and thought it worth preserving.

Armstrong made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 16 Keefe Avenue preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Commission members expressed their support for a rear addition on the house that would save the architectural integrity of the original structure, and that the proposed design and shared driveway were appropriate to the house and setting.

Armstrong made a motion to waive the demo delay on 16 Keefe Avenue with the condition that staff approves the materials. The owner committed to sheathing the whole structure, including the addition, with cedar shingle. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED waive the demo delay at 16 Keefe Avenue based on approved plans.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

1. **8-10 Keefe Avenue – Amend Waiver**
Request to amend waiver

Ward Shifman, owner and developer of this address, presented replacement plans at the January 2015 hearing that were approved for a waiver. The windows on the proposed design were subsequently changed and the developer returned for a revised approval. This item was added to this agenda in error: the decision from the January hearing stipulated that staff could approve the proposed windows administratively. Windows were the only proposed change, so staff was able to approve them. This item was not heard at this hearing.

At the January 2015 hearing, Commission members were pleased that the historic home at 22-24 River Street would be preserved as part of this project, and that both buildings captured the scale of the neighborhood. Fitzmaurice made a motion to waive the demo delay on the houses at 22-24 River Street and 8-10 Keefe Road provided that all materials and window types are included on the construction plans for approval by staff. Armstrong seconded the motion.

2. **78 Roundwood Road – Partial Demolition Review**

Request to add second story

No owner was present for this item. The Commission decided to vote on whether the house was preferably preserved, but chose not to vote on proposed plans for the second story addition until the owner was present.

Staff reported that this house was built in 1941 in a neighborhood of homes built in the same massing, scale and similar design. This house was surveyed on an area form for Roundwood Road. James Sharpe is listed as the home's first owner. There are no other building permits on file with the exception of one in 2011 for a rear deck. James Sharpe still lived here in 1943, and then Robert E. Segal, executive director of the Jewish Community Council, lived here by 1949. By 1961 the owner was Malcolm Long, executive at Barnard Print, who continued to live here through at least 1980. If building permits are any indication, this house has seen no alterations since it was built in 1941, and retains its original massing scale and context in a neighborhood of similar homes. Staff recommended this house preferably preserved for historic context.

Christine Murphy, an abutter at 84 Roundwood, came to speak in support of the project. A letter from an abutter, who expressed the same sentiment, was also read into the record. Commission members discussed that this neighborhood had been previously surveyed for its post WWII integrity and noted that there was very little new development in the neighborhood.

Dimond made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. Armstrong seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 78 Roundwood Road preferably preserved for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templar, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

3. **924 Watertown Street – Partial Demolition Review**

Request to remove front and west sides for additions

Mark Sangiolo, architect for this project, is proposing to remove and replace the front and west sides of this Queen Anne Style house.

Staff reported that there is no evidence of a house at this address in 1895, but the house is standing by 1907. In both 1895 and 1907, Henry H. Hunt is listed as the owner. This Queen Anne Style house has undergone

some alterations, including loss of some architectural detail and obscuring of shingling that could be visible beneath the vinyl siding, but its massing, scale, and remaining tenets of the Queen Anne style are still evident. In 1907, city directories show the house as vacant. In 1915, Anna Allen and family members and boarders were living in the house. By 1920 Cathryn J. Davis is listed as owner, and obtained a permit for the first garage at this address. She had it moved not long after, but by 1932 had obtained a permit to build a new one. By 1940 Gilbert Larish, a salesman, lived in the house. By 1949 the occupant was John Enegess, chief probation officer for the City of Newton court system. By 1959 the owner was listed on permits as "Johnson," but Enegess still lived in the house. The ownership remained the same until the 1970s, and was likely rented much of the time. Staff recommends this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity as a relatively intact Queen Anne structure, and for historic context with the surrounding Queen Anne structures in the neighborhood.

Commission members discussed the merits of this Queen Anne style house.

Klapper made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 924 Watertown Street preferably preserved for historic context and architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Mr. Sangiolo told the Commission his client needed more space for his family and wanted to add additions to the front and right side of the house. He added that the addition would have wood clapboard siding with a porch across the front. He added that the front entry would be expanded and that the addition would be set back from the elevation.

Commission members commented that the addition was proposed for the front of the house, which would compromise one of its classic Queen Anne motifs: the faceted corner. The Commission wanted to see the bay addition match the original house, and asked if there was some way to make it smaller. The proposed addition was competing with the original design, in the Commission's view, and the proposed pitch and profile should better match the original house. The owner wanted the added mass of the addition and said the extra gable feature preserved what he thought was the Victorian look of the house.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the waiver for plans as drawn, with modifications to the proposed family room required by changing the corner to reflect the historic existing profile of the house. Revised plans are to be submitted to staff and Mark Armstrong for a follow-up review. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver for plans as drawn, with modifications to the proposed family room required by changing the corner to reflect the historic existing profile of the house. Revised plans are to be submitted to staff and Mark Armstrong for a follow-up review.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

4. **17 Barbara Road – Waiver Review**
Request to waive demo delay

Charles Calhoun, architect for the project for his client Richard Saris, returned to the Commission with revised plans from the February 2015 hearing that were based on the following comments: Commission members expressed concern about the amount of space occupied by the garage in the design; the hipped roof element in this design, which was not found elsewhere on the street; that there was too much space around the proposed window over the garage and that it was set too high; that the proposed roof plan was not simple enough to match others in this neighborhood; and that the house and garage were out of proportion to each other.

In October, staff reported that the house was built in 1951. This modest Cape Style house was one of many intact examples of this style on Barbara Road, all of which were built post-war. In April 2014, the house at 39 Barbara Road was voted preferably preserved by this Commission. The first owner and builder of the house was Antonio D'Angelo. Unlike the house at #39, which had no architect listed, this architect was Joseph Selwyn of Belmont. In 1959, the owner was Robert Drago, a tailor. His wife Mary was employed by Raytheon. In the 1970s the owner was Joseph Capalino, who obtained a permit to add a front dormer and rear addition. The Capalino family owned the house until at least 2005. The massing, modest design and construction, and siting on the lot are in keeping with the historic context of the neighborhood, which visually has changed little from its construction c.1951.

Commission members liked the revised project and said the architect appropriately responded to comments made at the February hearing. Elements of the design were scaled down, the mansard roof was removed, and the garage was set further back on the front façade, among other improvements.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the waiver based on the revised plans. Dimond seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver at 17 Barbara Road based on the revised plans.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

27 Staniford Street – Waiver Review

Request to waive demo delay

The new owners of this property, Y.Lisa Luo and George Zhang, and their architect, Mr. Lee, presented their plan to replace the house at this address with a new house of similar design. This worker cottage first came to the NHC at the October 23, 2014 hearing and was preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

In October, staff reported that this house was standing at this location by 1881, and was owned by P. Ferrick, a laborer at R.M. Pulsifer's. He continued to own this house until at least 1886, one of only five houses on the block at the time. By 1895, Maria and John Othmer, clerk, owned the house and it had two outbuildings on the rear of the lot. By 1907 the house was owned by Adeline Hannah and Charles, (produce) with a house and two barns. John J. Leary, a peddler, bought the house in 1917 and owned it in 1920 when he obtained a permit to install a stone chimney on the east side of the house. In 1930 he extended the front porch. He continued to own the house until at least 1950, when his widow Mary took ownership. Mary lived in the house until at least 1975, almost 60 years of Leary ownership. This 3 by 2-bay worker house is an early example in this Auburndale neighborhood (similar in many ways to 3 Newland) and as such staff recommended it preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

At the March hearing, Commission members agreed the proposed style and massing would mitigate the loss of this structure in the neighborhood, with details such as the front porch, and the single window rhythm of the windows. Commission members asked that the proposed dormers be smaller, and that a single window in the center second story be flanked by sidelights rather than present a double-window profile.

Armstrong made a motion to approve the waiver based on the plans as presented, with the condition that the dormers be smaller, and that the center window on the second story front be single with sidelights rather than paired sash windows as presented. The Commission also said that paired windows in the gable over the bedroom are approved. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to approve the waiver at 27 Staniford Street based on the plans as presented, with the condition that the dormers be smaller, and that the center window on the second story front be single with sidelights rather than paired sash windows as presented. The Commission also said that paired windows in the gable over the bedroom are approved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

5. **163 and 165 Herrick Road – Demolition Review** Request to demolish cottage and mechanical building

John Dragget of Benchmark Senior Living, a representative from Andover Theological Seminary, and Alan Schlesinger, attorney, presented their plan to remove two buildings from the ATS campus in preparation for a senior center wing addition to the Farwell Hall historic campus building. Of the two buildings, one was not

included in the National Register district when the nomination was written in 1986, and the other was deemed not to be contributing to the district. In 2015, both buildings meet the criteria for significance. Narratives for the buildings, a mechanical support building and a superintendent cottage, were included in your packets and were presented by its consultant from Epsilon Associates, Brian Lever.

Commission members agreed that the maintenance building appeared to have no architectural significance, as it had no architectural detail that could be deemed to be contributing to the NR district. Members also thought that the proposed project, and protecting the significance of the Farwell Hall building, outweighed the integrity of the small cinder-block cottage.

Armstrong made a motion to find the maintenance building and the cottage at 163 and 165 Herrick Road not preferably preserved. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on March 26, 2015 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-0:

RESOLVED to find the maintenance building and the cottage at 163 and 165 Herrick Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative: Abstained:

Nancy Grissom, Member
Jeff Templer, Member
Mark Armstrong, Member
Peter Dimond, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

6. **Administrative Discussion:**

- a) The February minutes were unanimously approved by members present.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:25pm.

And here's a new section: Properties that were visited in the field, researched and deemed not to be significant by staff/NHC chair and were **not** sent to an NHC hearing are listed below. Administratively approved partial demolitions also appear below. This section was added at the request of the Aldermen. The following addresses were found to be not significant (NS) for this agenda month, or had partial demolitions (PD) approved administratively. All demo applications are available to be viewed at the Planning Office. Contact Katy Hax Holmes via email kholmes@newtonma.gov with questions.

19 Gambier Street (PD)
79 Washington Park, garage (NS)
301 Cypress Street, rear addition (PD)
239 Cypress Street, side addition (PD)
39 Bontempo Road, full demo (NS)
16 Brandeis Circle, full demo (NS)
32 Littlefield Road, full demo (NS)

Katy Hax Holmes
Commission Staff